Please note, these transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

SPECIAL MEETING

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

INTEGRATED WASTE MANAGEMENT BOARD

SPECIAL WASTE AND MARKET DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

JOE SERNA, JR., CALEPA BUILDING

1001 1 STREET

2ND FLOOR

COASTAL HEARING ROOM

SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA

THURSDAY, JANUARY 30, 2003

AFTERNOON SESSION

ii

## APPEARANCES

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Jose Medina, Chairperson

Michael Paparian

Carl Washington

BOARD MEMBERS

Cheryl Peace

STAFF

Mark Leary, Executive Director

Julie Nauman, Chief Deputy Director

Kathryn Tobias, Chief Counsel

Jim Lee, Deputy Director

Martha Gildart

## INDEX

	PAGE
Afternoon Session	1
Commercialization Grant Program	2
Green Buildings/Sustainable Building	4
Rubberized Asphalt Concrete Technology Centers	5
Caltrans Signs	6
RMDZ Loan Program	8
State Parks Department Funding	9
Waste Prevention and Market Development Division	10
Tires Database	10
Buy Recycled Certification Audits	12
Rubberized Asphalt Concrete Grant System	12
Public Testimony	21
Cliff Ashcroft Asphalt Pavement Association	21
Questions/Comments	24
Karen Gerbosi Beebe Family Ranch	24
Murray Quance BAS Recycling, Inc.	26
Leandra Swent Southern Sonoma County Resource Conservation District	28
Questions/Comments	30
Muluneh Sime Nevada Automotive Test Center	32
Harlan Sethe West Valley Citizen Air Watch	33

iv

## INDEX

	PAGE
Public Testimony - continued	
Dr. Priscilla Albright West Valley Citizen Air Watch	36
Joyce Eden West Valley Citizen Air Watch	39
Donna Liu Natural Resources Defense Council	44
Questions/Comments	47
Muluneh Sime Nevada Automotive Test Center	51
Sudheer Helekar Advanced Recycling Sciences	51
Jerry Coffin Tire Conversion Technologies	55
Questions/Comments	57
Barry Takallou CRM Company	59
Questions/Comments	60
Jane Crue California District Attorneys Association	61
Questions/Comments	62
Michael Theroux Theroux for the Environment	65
Galen Baker Prison Industry Authority	66
Vicki Kramer California Department of Health Services also on behalf of John Stroh, Mosquito and Vector Control Association of California	68
Questions/Comments	70

## INDEX

	Page
Public Testimony - continued	
George Larson Lakin Tire	71
Bill McGavern Sierra Club California	73
Jana Nairn Golden Byproducts, Inc.	75
Closing Remarks	76
Adjournment	77
Reporter's Certificate	78

AFTERNOON	SESSION

- 2 --000--
- 3 BOARD MEMBER: I spoke with Joyce Eden at the
- 4 break about things that transpired this morning. And,
- 5 counsel, is that adequate for an ex parte -- we are
- 6 recording this but we don't have a court reporter. Do I
- 7 need to do a written ex parte?
- 8 MS. SPEAKER: No, as long as it's on the tape.
- 9 BOARD MEMBER: Thank you.
- 10 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: And I spoke with Jana Nairn of
- 11 Golden By Products regarding their tire cogeneration plant.
- 12 And because this is being tape recorded rather than
- 13 transcribed, we're going to ask the persons who speak,
- 14 please state your name very clearly and who you are with.
- 15 It's our intention here to get through this
- 16 portion as quickly as we can, such that we can open it up to
- 17 public comment before Board Member Washington has to leave
- 18 at 2:00.
- 19 So we'll pick up where we left off, and I believe
- 20 that, Board Member Washington, you had a recommendation to
- 21 make?
- 22 BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: Yeah, Mr. Chair, I would
- 23 like to increase the playground cover grants from 800,000 to
- 24 a million.
- 25 (Pause.)

1 MS. GILDART: Okay, staff -- oh, I'm sorry. I was

- 2 just going to say staff had pointed out on the earlier item
- 3 there, the tire recycling conference, we had forgot to
- 4 discuss that. Does anyone want to go back?
- 5 We do biennial conferences, you know, every two
- 6 years, try and do a conference that brings together folks
- 7 involved in the recycling and permitting and operation of
- 8 tire facilities. It's just sort of standard --
- 9 BOARD MEMBER: I would support that for 100,000,
- 10 as you have it.
- 11 MS. GILDART: Okay, we'll put that in. Sorry to
- 12 disrupt you, but I wanted to make sure we caught that before
- 13 he left.
- 14 So the next item then is the commercialization
- 15 grant program. This is one now we've been doing for several
- 16 years. I think several of you are very familiar with the
- 17 issues involved. It's a chance to provide money -- most of
- 18 our grant programs are directed at local governments for
- 19 things like cleanup enforcement, playground mats, et cetera.
- 20 This is one that's directed to business to help
- 21 them either increase their recycling capabilities or to add
- 22 new product lines. It's not a research effort; it's how to
- 23 take those products into the market. So that's why we call
- 24 it a commercialization grant.
- 25 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (inaudible).

```
1 MS. GILDART: Grants. Oh, I'm sorry, I thought
```

- 2 we'd done those. You're right. Track grants. So that's a
- 3 million.
- 4 Yeah, staff was proposing a million for the first
- 5 year and 1.2 million for the next three years -- the next
- 6 two years, dropping to a million and then dropping to zero,
- 7 with this idea that we're sort of getting through the hump
- 8 of the pent-up demand. Because we only started this program
- 9 two years ago.
- 10 Are there any recommendations on funding levels?
- 11 BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: I quess the question I
- 12 would have in terms of track and other recreational
- 13 surfaces. What are we talking about here? Are these
- 14 community colleges?
- 15 MS. GILDART: They're directed at schools, park
- 16 districts, community colleges, Indian Tribes.
- 17 BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: Mr. Chair, I'd like to
- 18 see that remain at one million across the board.
- 19 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, so be it, one million
- 20 across the board.
- 21 MS. GILDART: Okay. One million across the board.
- BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: Yeah.
- MS. GILDART: Okay. These grants are -- the
- 24 playground mat grant, just to give you a sense of
- 25 proportion, have been offered -- but obviously we can change

- 1 this year-by-year -- have been offered 25,000 per. The
- 2 track and recreational surfacing are up to 100,000, because
- 3 if, indeed, a school wants to put in a track that's a fairly
- 4 significant outlay of funds, so just to let you know the
- 5 size range there.
- 6 Okay, so now line 13, the product
- 7 commercialization grants. As I said, this is one that's
- 8 been offered now for a couple years at \$2 million. It's one
- 9 of a few grants we have that goes directly to businesses to
- 10 help them in expanding recycling capabilities.
- 11 So, any comments on that one?
- 12 No? Okay. Shall we hold it at \$2 million across
- 13 the years?
- 14 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: We'll do that at this --
- 15 MS. GILDART: Okay. The next one is green
- 16 buildings/sustainable building line item. Just because of
- 17 the budget shortfall for the '03/04 fiscal year we had
- 18 proposed to decrease that slightly to 400,000 just that one
- 19 year, and then go back to the 500,000 level.
- 20 Having added monies to our research component we
- 21 are going to -- we're already over the amount of money we'd
- 22 allocated there, so we have to keep track of these. I mean
- 23 once we get through this column we can go to the final
- 24 table. But I'm afraid we're going to have to look for
- 25 places to cut.

1 So I don't know if you want to leave this at

- 2 400,000 or make any changes here.
- 3 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: We'll proceed with what you have
- 4 on it.
- 5 MS. GILDART: Okay, so that's 400 the first year;
- 6 500 thereafter.
- 7 The rubberized asphalt concrete technology
- 8 centers. These are the two with Los Angeles County and
- 9 Sacramento County. They do training, outreach, design
- 10 approvals and recommendations. They have what they call an
- 11 incentives grant program which helps local governments
- 12 provide for, design, review and QAQC processes during the
- 13 actual application of rubberized asphalt.
- 14 It is currently at 500,000 through all five years.
- 15 And staff was proposing to slightly increase that. That's
- 16 certainly open to discussion based on how it ties in with
- 17 the AB-1346 Kuehl Bill RAC grants, which are later in this
- 18 list.
- 19 I don't know if you want to make any determination
- 20 here or wait till we discuss the Kuehl Bill stuff?
- 21 BOARD MEMBER: I'm fine with proceeding, but also
- 22 the additional item that should be mentioned is that we have
- 23 a program evaluation happening of the centers that hopefully
- 24 will give us good information about what the future needs of
- 25 the centers will be, and how to accomplish those. Whether

1 we might need more money. It's hard to believe we'd need

- 2 less money for them, but certainly in terms of program
- 3 delivery stuff, that evaluation may wind up informing us
- 4 even better later this year.
- 5 MS. GILDART: So do we want to pencil something in
- 6 here or come back to it when we --
- 7 BOARD MEMBER: I would suggest you go ahead and
- 8 leave the numbers at 500,000 --
- 9 MS. GILDART: Five hundred --
- 10 BOARD MEMBER: -- up to 600,000. I'm comfortable
- 11 with that at this point, but --
- MS. GILDART: Okay.
- BOARD MEMBER: -- at this point it's monopoly
- 14 money until we get to the end in trying to make the numbers
- 15 work.
- MS. GILDART: Um-hum. Okay. The signs for
- 17 Caltrans. That's something we thought we could start
- 18 fitting it in as we work with them on specific projects to
- 19 make the requirement project-by-project, rather than trying
- 20 to fund it separately, because we've not had much success in
- 21 working that one out.
- 22 So we were proposing zeroing out that 30,000 signs
- 23 for Caltrans projects.
- 24 BOARD MEMBER: Two years ago we talked about the
- 25 importance of this as a way of promoting RAC. You're saying

1 that Caltrans just hasn't been willing to identify RAC

- 2 segments?
- 3 MS. GILDART: It's not a high priority for them to
- 4 put these sorts of signs up. And they have so many
- 5 different requirements on signage, letter height, whether
- 6 it's break-away materials so cars won't impact, and dah,
- 7 dah, dah, dah, it just got really complicated.
- 8 Of course, we could always do what the gentleman,
- 9 was that in Los Angeles or San Diego, the artist who did his
- 10 own sign and hung it up over the freeway and Caltrans never
- 11 noticed, because he duplicated it so well.
- 12 (Laughter.)
- 13 MS. GILDART: That was in the newspapers awhile
- 14 back. I did think about that at the time.
- 15 BOARD MEMBER: I think it's important to draw
- 16 attention to these projects. One of the suggestions we had
- 17 at the workshop in Van Nuys was to identify online in some
- 18 way maps of where these projects are.
- 19 But I think that overall we need to do more
- 20 promotion of what's happening with RAC.
- 21 BOARD MEMBER: This is a way of promoting it. If
- 22 we don't do it this way I think we need to look at
- 23 alternative ways of assuring that we're getting the word out
- 24 about the importance of RAC and where it's being used.
- 25 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Well, I agree with Board Member

1 Paparian in regard to having it indicated on websites or in

- 2 other ways. The issue here has to do with signs. I know
- 3 that signs is a complex area having to do with the state
- 4 highways. So I think that, you know, I would support it at
- 5 this time, zero for signs.
- 6 But if we want to dedicate some money to
- 7 publicizing where we have RAC projects, we can certainly do
- 8 that. I would favor that. But I would just not leave it
- 9 signage, because that is problematic.
- 10 MS. GILDART: And I think it's something we can
- 11 fold into the RAC centers and maybe even the Kuehl Bill,
- 12 too, some of that public outreach and information. Okay.
- 13 The next item is the RMDZ loan program. That's
- 14 been quite successful the last couple of years. And staff's
- 15 recommending continuing that at the current funding level.
- 16 That's \$2 million.
- 17 BOARD MEMBER: As I understand it those RMDZ loans
- 18 were slated for a ten-year period, and we're in the process
- 19 of revising those?
- 20 MS. GILDART: It's possible, I'm not quite sure
- 21 how the market division conducts those, but --
- 22 BOARD MEMBER: Yeah, that was my understanding
- 23 from (inaudible).
- 24 MS. GILDART: Okay, the next item is actually just
- $\,$  25  $\,$  sort of a modification of something we had there before, so

1 I don't know, maybe it should have been in blue ink here in

- 2 the staff proposal.
- 3 We had been proposing to fund the State Parks
- 4 Department at a 200,000 level per year to do things like
- 5 rubberized asphalt, recycled content signs or materials, you
- 6 know, I mean bumpers. You can do recycled tire rubber
- 7 bumpers in parking lots and the pavements and mats and
- 8 things, at restrooms, or whatever.
- 9 Because of some interest expressed by a couple of
- 10 state agencies, we thought well, maybe we should broaden
- 11 that a little so that other agencies than the State Parks
- 12 could propose specific projects here.
- The one example we've heard recently was a
- 14 proposal about weed suppression mats to be used along
- 15 highways by Caltrans that could be produced by the someone
- 16 like the Prison Industry Authority. But there might need to
- 17 be some funds made available to assist that. And so staff
- 18 had proposed a roughly \$400,000 amount for the first two
- 19 years on that program.
- 20 BOARD MEMBER: I think this is a positive change
- 21 looking at state agencies overall. One of the five goals
- 22 stated in the intent language of 876 was to increase state
- 23 government's procurement and use of recycled content tire
- 24 products. And I think this would help accomplish that.
- 25 I think we may even want to -- because it was

1 called out at such a high level in 876, and because of our

- 2 overall efforts in trying to get state agencies, I think
- 3 it's part of our strategic plan, even, to get state agencies
- 4 more and more engaged in the purchase of recycled content
- 5 products, use of recycled content products, that I'd suggest
- 6 upping this to 600,000 a year into the future.
- 7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (inaudible).
- 8 BOARD MEMBER: Yeah.
- 9 MS. GILDART: Okay, the next two items are in-
- 10 house activities through the Waste Prevention and Market
- 11 Development Division.
- 12 They had been funded, the conference at 50,000 and
- 13 the CalMax Wrap programs at 25,000. And through earlier
- 14 actions of the Board indicating a desire to increase those
- 15 funding levels, we are trying to reflect that in these two,
- 16 at the 75,000 and 33,000 level.
- Okay, so we'll go with those?
- The rebate study was actually that one-time study,
- 19 so it will be dropped off eventually. We're just carrying
- 20 along some of the line items so you can see what happens to
- 21 them.
- 22 Tires database. This is a proposal from the staff
- 23 level trying to develop something that's going to be a very
- 24 comprehensive linked database. And we have waste tire
- 25 facility data in the Board's solid waste information system,

1 SWIS. However the SWIS database was designed for landfill

- 2 disposal. So the idea of waste coming in and staying there,
- 3 and tonnages and all that stuff.
- 4 The facility permits are more for business
- 5 operations for materials come in and materials go out,
- 6 materials come in, materials go out. You've got fluctuating
- 7 business patterns based on economic market conditions and
- 8 all that.
- 9 Staff was thinking it would be useful if we could
- 10 somewhat redesign requirements similar to SWIS, but have
- 11 their own tire facility database that would then link to
- 12 some of the grant information in the Board's grant
- 13 management system database, which you can call up who
- 14 received grants, who has permits, what condition are they
- 15 in, are they in compliance. And link it also to some of the
- 16 product manufacturers and types of products and materials
- 17 where these supplies come from.
- So it's a pretty comprehensive database system
- 19 that staff was proposing. Obviously, you know, we don't
- 20 have to do it in this very first year if we have budget
- 21 constraints. But the proposal had been to put \$100,000 in
- 03/04 and \$150,000 in 04/05 to get something like this
- 23 designed and set up.
- 24 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: We'll leave it in for now unless
- 25 there's any objections.

```
1 MS. GILDART: Okay. This Buy Recycled
```

- 2 Certification audits, I believe, is to supplement the waste
- 3 prevention market development division's SABRAC program,
- 4 State Agency Buy Recycled, where we have to track through
- 5 our grants and contracts and other state agency grants and
- 6 contracts, the purchase of recycled content materials
- 7 including tires. And this would be a way of going through
- 8 and auditing to insure that those numbers are accurate as
- 9 reported.
- Okay, so stick with that at 50,000? Okay.
- 11 The last one. The rubberized asphalt concrete
- 12 grant system. This is staff's attempt to incorporate the
- 13 AB-1346 Kuehl Bill requirements to set up a grant program
- 14 for local governments to use rubberized asphalt.
- 15 It's still very early in development stages; it's
- 16 a little bit hard right now to have numbers. The first year
- 17 we were proposing \$20,000 as a way, it would be coming out
- 18 of the Board's tire fund. It's not necessarily part of any
- 19 Kuehl Bill fund. It's just an attempt perhaps to build up
- 20 interest, explain to local governments what the program and
- 21 the process is. So that when we actually announce the
- 22 application period, we'll have sufficient applicants coming
- 23 into it to use the monies.
- 24 And then we had proposed for the first full year
- 25 of implementation we'd start at a million, building it year

1 by year to the 1.6 million which is close to the 16 percent

- 2 of the overall market budget that the bill indicated is the
- 3 preferable funding level.
- 4 Now, the reason that one-year delay, I had touched
- 5 on it earlier, is an attempt to give the Board some
- 6 flexibility and insure that the dollars are actually used
- 7 each year.
- 8 One of the problems that we've seen, and I think
- 9 almost anyone living in California has seen, is that a
- 10 paving project is a fairly low priority on a local
- 11 government budget. You know, they got a street with some
- 12 potholes, they want to repave it, they don't have the money,
- 13 they can patch it, you know. They fill a few potholes and
- 14 that's it. They can put it off year to year, if necessary.
- 15 They get a lot of complaints from the citizens, but if
- 16 you're faced, in a time of economic downturn and budget
- 17 restraints, with choosing between fire and police and
- 18 schools and paving a road, the roads aren't usually the
- 19 first in line.
- 20 And we were concerned if we followed the Board's
- 21 typical grant process where we announce an application
- 22 period. They come in. We select the awardees. We write
- 23 grant agreements with each one and dedicate the money that
- 24 fiscal year, and then give them two years to build it, if
- 25 they don't build it in that time period those monies are not

1 reassignable. They revert to the fund, and we've not used

- 2 them.
- 3 So we were trying to dream up a way that we could
- 4 get a list of qualifying projects through a review-and-
- 5 approval process; and be able to use those monies as they
- 6 build them. And just go down the list on a sort-of first-
- 7 come/first-served for qualified projects in the same fiscal
- 8 year. And that way not have our money hung up.
- 9 So to do that we were proposing this
- 10 implementation in the fiscal year 04/05.
- 11 BOARD MEMBER: I support your rationale and the
- 12 amounts that you have there. The only concern that I had
- 13 was in regard to the size of the grants, 6,250 to 50,000. I
- 14 know in a lot of the cities that have prevailing wage rates,
- 15 6250 won't buy them much.
- MS. GILDART: Well, that was based on the formula
- 17 in the bill of \$2.50 per ton for project sizes ranging from
- 18 I think 2500 tons to 5000 -- 20,000 tons. So if you do 2.50
- 19 times that size range, then the minimum grant would be 6,250
- and the maximum would be 50,000.
- 21 Yes, I think we're more likely to get that upper
- 22 end. But that was just the formula in the bill.
- 23 BOARD MEMBER: Can I ask the question that had
- 24 come up, there's some peculiar language in the bill having
- 25 to do with the amount spent on this program. We just got a

1 legal analysis this morning. But the question that had come

- 2 up was that the legislation says that if we do this program
- 3 it shall be 16 percent of the market development pot, to the
- 4 extent possible. And the way the language in the bill reads
- 5 is to the extent possible, depending on the number of
- 6 qualified applications and whether there is a sufficient
- 7 supply of crumb rubber. Funds allocated pursuant to this
- 8 section shall be equal to 16 percent of the budgeted amount
- 9 for market development.
- 10 So the question that had come up before was are we
- 11 limited in our findings to the number of qualified
- 12 applicants and a sufficient supply of crumb rubber, or -- if
- 13 we allocate less than 16 percent. Or do we have a broader
- 14 capability there? It sounded like, from the legal analysis,
- 15 that we do have a broader capability to make findings and
- 16 therefore don't have to allocate at exactly 16 percent.
- 17 I'm not sure if you followed me on that, but --
- 18 CHIEF COUNSEL TOBIAS: No, I did. We did not
- 19 address that particular issue, and we can look at that
- 20 quickly on whether there are other criteria that we can use.
- 21 And, Martha, I don't think, although I think we
- 22 talked about this with her, I don't think she's seen the
- 23 complete analysis.
- I think, and we can continue to look into this as
- 25 we develop this, but it might be better to spend no money in

1 a year on this, and then be ready the next year to implement

- 2 it, as opposed to spending some kind of money on it, and
- 3 then triggering that concern of, you know, we're spending
- 4 less than 16 percent on it, even though we're doing
- 5 something with it.
- 6 If that 20,000 that's in there is supposed to be
- 7 for, you know, staff time to get it up to speed and stuff,
- 8 I'm not sure that's what the money was supposed to be spent
- 9 on. So, --
- 10 BOARD MEMBER: Okay, I mean for purposes today
- 11 maybe we should keep these amounts in here. I'm fine
- 12 conceptually with the amounts, but legally it sounds like
- 13 maybe there needs to be a little more scrutiny of the law
- 14 and of what's being proposed here to make sure it's
- 15 consistent.
- MS. GILDART: Yeah, I think the \$20,000 in one
- 17 year is probably not going to work. I think what we could
- 18 do for next year is say we're going to work on
- 19 implementation; we're not going to make any grants because
- 20 we can't get the program up that fast. And then, you know,
- 21 after that, the following years we're going to have to make
- 22 some kind of estimation if you want to fund at the 16
- 23 percent, what that 16 percent might be at any given time.
- 24 And then we'll look into your question about the
- 25 criteria.

1 BOARD MEMBER: Yeah, and my basic question is it

- 2 okay for us to fund at less than 16 percent?
- 3 MS. GILDART: At the moment I think it's zero or
- 4 16 percent. If you want to fund some. Unless you don't get
- 5 applicants and unless you don't get the other thing.
- 6 There's also -- there's always an impossibility criteria.
- 7 And so that's what you could use for next year. You could
- 8 say, well, it was really impossible for us to get that
- 9 program out the door, so we didn't fund it.
- 10 So, I don't think it's a problem not spending the
- 11 money, but we will look at your other question.
- 12 BOARD MEMBER: Based on what you're saying it
- would be more prudent for us to go zero in 03/04?
- 14 MS. GILDART: That would be my recommendation at
- 15 this time.
- 16 BOARD MEMBER: Yes, I would like to go with that
- 17 recommendation.
- MS. GILDART: Okay, well, I think that 20,000
- 19 deletes, yeah.
- 20 Okay, so can we flip to the total sheet and see
- 21 how much we're over? I think it's close to a million.
- 22 The overall -- is that it, the overall -- 33 -- So
- 23 it's 2 million over.
- So, what's the pleasure of the Board? Do you want
- 25 to take public comment now and then see later where we

1 should make some cuts to try and come in under budget? Or

- 2 do you want to wait --
- 3 BOARD MEMBER: I think because this particular
- 4 item is going to come before the special waste committee,
- 5 and also the budget and admin committee, and the three of us
- 6 that are here on this Panel sit on those very same
- 7 committees, there's no reason that we couldn't get --
- 8 BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: Well, my understanding
- 9 that it's not going before the budget and admin committee.
- 10 MS. GILDART: Catherine, this is a question on the
- 11 public notice. This had not been put on the February Board
- 12 agenda. It wasn't discussed until yesterday afternoon when
- 13 we learned that Committee Member Jones wasn't going to be
- 14 here, that maybe we'd want to take it to the Board so he'd
- 15 have a chance to look at this.
- 16 So we're trying to get a title in for the February
- 17 Board meeting, but I don't think we've met the time
- 18 requirements for the budget or any of the other committees.
- 19 MS. TOBIAS: Tomorrow's the notice for the Board
- 20 and --
- 21 MS. GILDART: For the Board --
- MS. TOBIAS: -- and the committee --
- MS. GILDART: So we can get it on the Board, but
- 24 we just don't have the ten-day public notice for the agenda
- 25 for the other committees.

1 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Nonetheless, this was going to

- 2 come before us again in March, was it not?
- 3 MS. GILDART: Yeah, in March. In March.
- 4 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Yeah.
- 5 MS. GILDART: We were trying to get something as
- 6 soon as February for some input.
- 7 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Well, I think for the -- for our
- 8 purposes this will come before, if you have a placeholder
- 9 for the February Board meeting, then this will come to the
- 10 Board. But after that it will still come --
- MS. GILDART: Yeah, --
- 12 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: -- back before the special waste
- 13 and budget and admin committee, and we have another go at
- 14 this. So it doesn't mean we have to come right out to the
- 15 penny here. The Board can cut these numbers down in our
- 16 Board meeting, and then we still get to tinker with this at
- 17 the March committee meetings. And then the Board meeting
- 18 when we do the final vote on this.
- 19 BOARD MEMBER: Just one point of clarification,
- 20 Chairman Medina. Again, so we should bring the item back at
- 21 the February Board meeting to consider the deliberations
- 22 on --
- 23 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: The final numbers --
- 24 BOARD MEMBER: -- the final numbers?
- 25 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Yes. Some final numbers. And

```
1 those may not remain even final at that time because it
```

- 2 still would go back before two committees, and then a final
- 3 vote by the Board.
- 4 So the Board actually votes on the final document,
- 5 you know, the figures that we have can still be worked on.
- 6 And the reason I want to do that is Board Member
- 7 Paparian wants to make some changes in the text of some of
- 8 the, you know, the five-year plan.
- 9 And again, I do want to accommodate, I have, by my
- 10 count, 15 or 16 persons that wish to speak. And I would
- 11 like to hear those persons while we still have a quorum and
- 12 while all three Members of the Committee are here.
- 13 So, Board Member Paparian, do you know how long
- 14 the text of changes that you're recommending will take?
- 15 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: I think I could do it in
- 16 two or three minutes, but, you know, I'm happy to wait until
- 17 after the public comment to get to those, if you want to.
- 18 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, with that, at this point
- 19 we will take public comment. And we're going to -- I'm
- 20 going to ask each speaker to please limit your testimony to
- 21 three minutes. And if you would, I know that a number of
- 22 you have testified at other committee meetings, so as not to
- 23 repeat some of the things you've said at other committee
- 24 meetings. But certain things based on what we've gone over
- 25 today, if you have something related to that, anything else

- 1 you wish to share with us.
- 2 The first person I'd like to call up is Mr. Cliff
- 3 Ashcroft with the Asphalt Pavement Association.
- 4 MR. ASHCROFT: Chairman Medina and Board Members,
- 5 it's a pleasure to be here today, and I will try to limit my
- 6 comments to under three minutes.
- 7 Some of you have seen me serve in the capacity
- 8 with the Rubber Pavements Association which I currently
- 9 stand as the Vice President. It is the world renown
- 10 association for the promotion and distribution of asphalt
- 11 rubber materials and promotion.
- 12 Today, I have been asked by the Asphalt Pavement
- 13 Association of California, of which I serve on a
- 14 subcommittee, the rubberized asphalt concrete committee, to
- 15 come up and address the Board.
- 16 And I want to start out by complimenting, number
- 17 one, the Board and its staff for what they have done in the
- 18 past in supporting the industry and recognizing the needs of
- 19 the industry. And also I want to compliment the rubberized
- 20 asphalt concrete technologies centers, both north and south,
- 21 for their commitment to helping to bring about a quality
- 22 product. And I think we have seen tremendous results from
- 23 the efforts of the Board, the funding and the RAC
- 24 committees.
- 25 I've been in this industry for 15 years, in the

1 rubberized asphalt concrete industry. So I saw it before

- 2 Caltrans would even use it or even think about using it to
- 3 where it is today.
- 4 I wanted to take just a second to give you a brief
- 5 update as to where things are at in the industry, what help
- 6 we think we need, and what help we'd like to be to the
- 7 efforts of the Board.
- 8 We've seen an industry that unfortunately, largely
- 9 due to funding and largely due to Caltrans issues, which we
- 10 are still trying desperately to pursue and understand, is
- 11 back to its usage levels of roughly a decade ago. And what
- 12 that means for an industry such as ourselves, I'm speaking
- 13 as far as the contracting side, but also the producers, is
- 14 we've seen an industry blossom and grow.
- 15 A lot of capital investments have been made,
- 16 anticipating that recycling was what was going to continue
- 17 taking place. And unfortunately, we've seen a substantial
- 18 drop, and we see many suppliers and producers struggling
- 19 just to keep their heads above the water right now.
- 20 I would like to see, as I said before, that the
- 21 actions of the Board and the funding has done a great deal
- 22 to promote this industry. And in my opinion, has been
- 23 extremely successful.
- 24 So, with that having been said, I was asked by the
- 25 Asphalt Pavement Association to come up, number one, and

1 compliment the Board and to say that we look forward to, as

- 2 an industry, stepping up to the plate and doing all we can
- 3 to promote the interest in recycling in the asphalt rubber
- 4 pavement industry.
- 5 With the anticipation of SB-1346 taking place and
- 6 being implemented, which we've learned more about today, we,
- 7 as an industry, would like to offer ourselves, make
- 8 ourselves available. If a committee needs to be formed, or
- 9 if we can participate in how to disseminate that funding,
- 10 whether we -- how the applications can be received and what
- 11 the real needs are out there, we'd be more than willing to
- 12 do that.
- 13 And we'd also like to ask -- this is just a
- 14 question. Understanding the budget shortfall, I was asked
- 15 by the Association to say if there were excess funds at the
- 16 end of the year, if those could go towards 1346 because the
- 17 16 percent was, so to speak, the minimum that was
- 18 identified.
- 19 So with that having been said, again with the
- 20 compliments being given for the sincere compliments for what
- 21 has been done and accomplished, with the dire needs of the
- 22 industry, anything that can be done to implement the
- 23 assistance in the way of 1346 of an immediate nature would
- 24 be greatly appreciated by the industry.
- 25 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, thank you, --

1 BOARD MEMBER: Mr. Chairman, just a quick comment

- 2 if I can.
- 3 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Yes.
- 4 BOARD MEMBER: One of your suggestions was
- 5 something I don't want to lose, and that was you wanted to
- 6 figure out a way to provide some regular input into the
- 7 program.
- 8 And I think that one of the things we may want to
- 9 look at is some sort of, you know, advisory group of
- 10 stakeholders from the recycling, you know, environmental
- 11 health, even the landfill sectors to help provide regular
- 12 advice in a public forum, to the entire program.
- So, I'll follow up on that.
- MR. ASHCROFT: Certainly. Appreciate that.
- 15 BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: Certainly appreciate
- 16 your optimism about the excess funds.
- 17 (Laughter.)
- 18 MR. ASHCROFT: You know, I was charged with that
- 19 Commission to say that, so I did my job.
- 20 BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: Thank you.
- MR. ASHCROFT: Thank you.
- 22 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Very good. The next speaker is
- 23 Karen Gerbosi.
- 24 MS. GERBOSI: That's me. Hello, my name is Karen
- 25 Gerbosi. I'm with the Beebe Family Ranch in Petaluma,

1 California. Most of the reason I came here today is that

- 2 since there are two new Members on the Committee I wanted to
- 3 take a few minutes to briefly introduce myself, and to
- 4 describe some of our concerns.
- 5 My brother, sister and I own a ranch in Petaluma.
- 6 And we're one of the legacy agricultural tire sites that's
- 7 there in Sonoma County. The last tires were placed on our
- 8 land in about 1985. At that time this was an accepted
- 9 standard practice, and was a method used by a number of
- 10 ranchers in Sonoma County. And at that time no
- 11 authorization, documentation or permits were required, and
- 12 there were no regulations prohibiting it until 1992.
- 13 I did prepare written comments with suggestions
- 14 for the update on the five-year plan, and submitted those in
- 15 October. And one of the important suggestions that I really
- 16 do want to make sure gets into the plan is that we want to
- 17 make sure that the legacy tire sites are considered legacy
- 18 agricultural tire sites, sites that have used tires to
- 19 control soil erosion, and that they not be considered
- 20 illegal. And that to have those revisions incorporated into
- 21 the five-year plan.
- 22 The other thing that I did want to do is I wanted
- 23 to thank -- Mr. Jones and staff came down to the sites in
- 24 Sonoma County last week and visited our sites. And we
- 25 really appreciated them taking their time and energy to do

- 1 that.
- 2 And lastly, I want to say that we, along with the
- 3 other owners of Sonoma County legacy tire sites, urge the
- 4 California Integrated Waste Management Board to use its
- 5 authority and resources to make these revisions to the five-
- 6 year plan and to move forward to accomplish solutions that
- 7 will satisfy the various state, federal, county and regional
- 8 agencies, as well a the landowners and any other concerned
- 9 parties.
- 10 Thank you very much for your time. I appreciate
- 11 being here. Thank you.
- 12 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you. The next speaker is
- 13 Murray Quance.
- 14 MR. QUANCE: Good afternoon, Chairman Medina,
- 15 Board Members. My name is Murray Quance, representing BAS
- 16 Recycling and environmental molding concepts. Thank you
- 17 very much for this opportunity.
- I will not be redundant and repeat all the good
- 19 programs that you have. I just would like to thank you on
- 20 behalf of our companies, that we take very seriously our
- 21 responsibilities to fulfill some of the grants and those
- 22 that we have received, and plan to fulfill that.
- I just wanted to take this opportunity just to
- 24 speak on behalf of my company and what I believe is just the
- 25 state of the industry for the crumb rubber recyclers from my

- 1 view.
- 2 Since 2002 energy has increased in pure terms 47
- 3 percent for us. The work in Caltrans has dropped 70 percent
- 4 by volume, such that right now all of us are squeezed on the
- 5 profitability side. Companies such as mine, where possible,
- 6 are diversifying as fast as they can in other markets to
- 7 take advantage of the investments.
- 8 But I can assure you that there are at least three
- 9 of my competitors right now that are in dire straits. And
- 10 as such, the market is in a very predatory pricing
- 11 situation.
- 12 My recommendation to you is -- based on what I
- 13 heard this morning, is the quickest way that in my judgment
- 14 that we can turn around is, as Cliff mentioned, the products
- 15 relative to the rubberized asphalt concrete. Anything that
- 16 can be done that can prioritize that, in my judgment, would
- 17 be the quickest way which would help the overall industry.
- 18 So anything that could be done in that area.
- 19 I believe programs such as the ones that Board
- 20 Member Washington talked about, the playgrounds, the fields,
- 21 I believe those markets will take care of themselves and
- 22 will grow.
- 23 But because the other companies, even more than I,
- 24 are so dependent on the asphalt concrete that I think
- 25 anything that can be done to prioritize and move them up

1 would strengthen that. Otherwise I'm concerned that we'll

- 2 wake up two or three years from now, when the market comes
- 3 back, and there might only be two recyclers, old tire
- 4 recyclers left in California. And then we'll all be the
- 5 worse for it.
- Thank you very much.
- 7 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you, Mr. Quance. And if
- 8 you will recall, during my tenure at Caltrans the use of
- 9 rubberized asphalt went up extremely high.
- 10 MR. QUANCE: I appreciate that.
- 11 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Leandra Swent.
- 12 MS. SWENT: Good afternoon, I'm Leandra Swent.
- 13 I'm the District Manager with Southern Sonoma County
- 14 Resource Conservation District.
- 15 And I won't go over the whole thing because it's
- 16 such a long story. One of the biggest concerns I had about
- 17 today's meeting was the recommendation to remove the short-
- 18 term remediation sites from the list in the five-year plan.
- 19 For those of you who are new to the Board, we've
- 20 been working on this project for ten years. Some of the
- 21 landowners were cited over ten years ago, and we've been
- 22 trying to come up with a method for remediation.
- 23 As Karen Gerbosi said, the tires were put in as a
- 24 recommended practice. It was not illegal to have them on
- 25 their sites until, I believe, the time was 1994. All these

- 1 tires were placed prior to 1980s.
- 2 So I had hoped that with the five-year plan we
- 3 could get an understanding of where the Board wanted to go
- 4 with these sites and other sites like them. There's never
- 5 been a determination at the staff level or at a Board level
- of how to move forward on these sites.
- 7 And, again, we're faced with -- we have three new
- 8 Board Members who are not up to speed on this subject.
- 9 There's a lot to know. And, again, we may have to re-
- 10 educate people. If you're all gone and staff doesn't know
- 11 which direction to go with these sites, we go back to ground
- 12 zero which we've done probably six or seven times over the
- 13 last ten years.
- 14 And I would hope that either they get covered in
- 15 the five-year plan with a Board recommendation for how to
- 16 move forward; or you give us some insight as to how we can
- 17 get on the books for staff to understand what the Board's
- 18 will is on these sites.
- 19 And that's really my biggest concern at this
- 20 point, is to be able to go forward with the Board's will,
- 21 whatever that is.
- 22 BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: You mentioned short-term
- 23 remediation or long-term?
- 24 MS. SWENT: The short-term remediation sites. As
- 25 Karen mentioned, we are listed under those in the five-year

1 plan. There's six landowners the RCD represents that are

- 2 listed in that, that are agricultural sites where the tires
- 3 were placed as a recommended practice.
- 4 We would like -- we recommended in a letter to the
- 5 Committee back in October that they be separated out, those
- 6 six sites, and other sites similar to them, and that they be
- 7 handled as a completely different situation than the short-
- 8 term remediation sites. And I would like to see it still
- 9 handled in the five-year plan that way. Or in some other
- 10 document that we can refer to down the road.
- 11 It gives us some cohesiveness and some
- 12 equitability to other sites that might come forward that are
- 13 similar to these, down the road.
- 14 BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: I would like to set up a
- 15 meeting with you so I can understand --
- MS. SWENT: I can't hear you, I'm sorry?
- 17 BOARD MEMBER WASHINGTON: I would like to set up a
- 18 meeting with you so I can understand the complex of the
- 19 issue we're talking about here, to make sure that I'm clear
- 20 as to what you guys have been trying to do over the last ten
- 21 years.
- 22 MS. SWENT: Okay, absolutely. And I would like to
- 23 extend any time you want to come down, like Mr. Jones did,
- 24 and see the sites, we'll take you on a tour and you can meet
- 25 the landowners and see what we're really talking about.

1 BOARD MEMBER: Mr. Chairman, I know that Mr. Jones

- 2 is trying to craft some suggestions to bring back to this
- 3 Committee and to the Board in terms of dealing with the
- 4 situation in Sonoma.
- 5 To answer your specific question, I would find it
- 6 hard to -- I'd be pleasantly surprised, but I find it hard
- 7 to believe we'd be able to specify in the five-year plan,
- 8 given our timing for the development of that, that we'd be
- 9 able to specify how we're going to resolve the Sonoma
- 10 situation.
- I think what you can look to, from my perspective,
- 12 in the five-year plan is that, you know, there are funds set
- 13 aside for clean up that, you know, should the state have any
- 14 obligation there, the state would have some funds available
- 15 to meet that obligation.
- 16 But, you know, at this point we don't know what,
- 17 if any, obligation the state may have with regards to the
- 18 clean up.
- 19 And then just for Mr. Washington's benefit, one of
- 20 the concerns that some of us have had is that there are six
- 21 sites, I believe, identified. There has been suggestion
- 22 that there are more sites that people have been reluctant to
- 23 reveal to us until they know how we're going to deal with
- 24 the first six sites.
- 25 So we may have additional liabilities up there

1 that we don't know yet what, if any, additional liabilities

- 2 we might have if we set the precedent first. So it's a
- 3 pretty complex issue.
- 4 MS. SWENT: Yes. And if we can't remedy this in
- 5 the five-year plan, I'd really like a recommendation of how
- 6 we can move forward so that we can come up with a
- 7 recommendation that the Board supports and is willing to put
- 8 down somewhere that can be followed up down the road with
- 9 staff.
- 10 So if you could make some recommendation to us,
- 11 that would be wonderful.
- 12 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, thank you.
- MS. SWENT: Thank you.
- 14 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: And our next speaker is Muluneh
- 15 Sime.
- 16 MR. SIME: Thank you, Mr. Chairman and Board
- 17 Members. My name is Muluneh Sime with Nevada Automotive
- 18 Test Center. We're contracted by Waste Management Board to
- 19 conduct research on the recycling content of the new tires.
- 20 And I just wanted to revisit what was discussed
- 21 this morning regarding the increased life span and recycled
- 22 content of new tires against what is going on in other
- 23 agencies, in terms of looking at tires and from a
- 24 performance standpoint.
- 25 A case in point is a program that is undertaken by

1 California Energy Commission, which looks at fuel efficient

- 2 tires. And I just wanted to follow up in the discussions
- 3 this morning, I wanted to kind of make a suggestion, if
- 4 possible, if those programs can be looked at relative to
- 5 each other because they have so much interaction in terms of
- 6 the outcome of the study.
- 7 Because, for example, if we look at the recycle
- 8 content of tire against the fuel efficient tires, there may
- 9 be some kind of competition from a technical standpoint,
- 10 competition that needs to be addressed at the early stage of
- 11 the program
- 12 So I thought I would -- there is already attention
- 13 paid by the Board to this issue, but I thought I would kind
- 14 of re-emphasize that. It may be part of the peer review or
- 15 maybe program coordination, or maybe put it in the research
- 16 and institution programs, whether private or university
- 17 program. But I thought I would kind of re-visit that topic.
- 18 And that would be my comment. Thank you very
- 19 much.
- 20 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, thank you. The next
- 21 speaker is Harlan Sethe.
- 22 MR. SETHE: Thank you. I am Harlan Sethe, a
- 23 member of the West Valley Citizen Air Watch, a group in
- 24 Santa Clara Valley.
- 25 I'm retired school teacher from the Cupertino

1 Union School District, and I'm appealing to you to be aware

- 2 of the fact that asthma deaths among children and young
- 3 people are increasing.
- 4 I received a report yesterday from Stanford
- 5 Childrens Hospital stating that in 1995 there were 42,333
- 6 asthma-related hospitalizations in California. And 42
- 7 percent of those were children.
- 8 The number 24 you had in your study about the
- 9 environmental health issues, you're going to donate about
- 10 \$250,000 to that area. I'd like to suggest that you people
- 11 make it a priority to take school districts within ten
- 12 miles, I'll say, of a kiln that's going to burn tires and
- 13 just see what the relationship is as far as the asthma is
- 14 concerned in that area.
- 15 In the Cupertino School District we're going to
- 16 have a speaker speak February 3rd. It's going to be a
- 17 secular County hospital case director, and the director is
- 18 going to talk about asthma. And he's going to talk to the
- 19 district P.E. teachers because we have an increasing amount
- 20 of asthma in our area.
- 21 I've taken the eighth grade students to Yosemite
- 22 National Park for 25 years. And each of the parents have to
- 23 fill out a medical record. And the medical records I've
- 24 examined over the years show increasing amounts of asthma in
- 25 our area, as far as the children are concerned.

```
1 The smoke irritation irritates a person's
```

- 2 bronchial tubes and the eyes and nose. So my major concern
- 3 is if you're going to burn tires, it's going to increase the
- 4 air pollution. So I'd like to have you please consider the
- 5 children of California when you are going to permit tire
- 6 burning in California.
- 7 Thank you.
- 8 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: We certainly will, and thank you
- 9 for your testimony.
- 10 BOARD MEMBER: Mr. Chairman.
- 11 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Yes.
- 12 BOARD MEMBER: Chairman Medina, I was wondering,
- 13 while we still have a quorum and the majority of our
- 14 stakeholders are still present, I'd just like to request a
- 15 little clarification on direction about when we're coming
- 16 back and when.
- 17 I know I'm a little confused about what your
- 18 expectation is for the February Board meeting --
- 19 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: I was getting ready to touch
- 20 just on that point.
- 21 BOARD MEMBER: Perfect, thank you very much.
- 22 Sorry to interrupt.
- 23 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: It was my intention to call a
- 24 meeting to finalize this process. I can't do it before ten
- 25 days because a ten-day notice is required. So that is my

```
1 intention, to call another meeting to finalize the
```

- 2 discussions that we've had.
- 3 BOARD MEMBER: The timeframe of that being
- 4 somewhere between the February Board meeting and the March
- 5 onset of Committee meetings?
- 6 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Correct.
- 7 BOARD MEMBER: After the February Board meeting
- 8 we'll set up a special meeting of this Committee to finalize
- 9 this --
- 10 (End tape 3A.)
- 11 BOARD MEMBER: -- and hopefully have a full
- 12 Committee present.
- 13 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: That's correct. We have --
- BOARD MEMBER: Okay, all right.
- 15 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: -- to just make allowances for
- 16 three schedules here.
- 17 BOARD MEMBER: Thank you for allowing me to --
- 18 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Yeah.
- 19 BOARD MEMBER: -- request that clarification.
- 20 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: So the next speaker is Dr.
- 21 Priscilla Albright.
- DR. ALBRIGHT: Hi. Can you hear all right? My
- 23 name is Dr. Priscilla Albright. I am a member of the West
- 24 Valley Citizens Air Watch group. And I'm very concerned
- 25 about the dangers of burning tires for fuel in cement kilns.

```
1 And I'm going to read some excerpts from a paper
```

- 2 by a Dr. Neil Carmen. He has a PhD in chemistry and he
- 3 served as a Texas Air Control Board Regional Investigator
- 4 for 12 years, with extensive technical experience in
- 5 synthetic rubber plants making rubber for tires.
- As a TACB official he conducted state pollution
- 7 inspections at one of the largest synthetic rubber plants in
- 8 the United States. Many inspections were performed at the
- 9 facility for compliance purposes, and they led to three
- 10 state enforcement actions, including a major lawsuit by the
- 11 State Attorney General's Environmental Protection Division,
- 12 in which Carmen served as the state's chief investigator.
- 13 He became very knowledgeable about toxic air
- 14 emissions being released, and their relationship to plant
- 15 problems in the synthetic rubber process. During his tenure
- 16 as a state air pollution control official he also inspected
- 17 large cement manufacturing facility which produced Portland
- 18 cement, and with the scientific experience he had, he
- 19 realized that one should oppose the disposal of wastes such
- 20 as tire-derived fuel or TDF, as it's called, in cement
- 21 kilns.
- 22 Hazardous chemicals used in synthetic rubber
- 23 manufacturing are regulated under the federal Clean Air Act.
- 24 Tires made from petrochemical feedstocks include two organic
- 25 chemicals, styrene and 1,3 butydiene. Substances used to

1 produce synthetic rubber for tires contain several hazardous

- 2 chemicals as primary constituents which may be emitted into
- 3 the air during high temperature incineration of tires in
- 4 cement kilns.
- 5 A large volume of benzene present in this TDF
- 6 waste treatment and its high temperature requirement for
- 7 complete combustion provides a pathway for creation of even
- 8 more highly toxic species, such as dioxins, -- I'm sure
- 9 you've all heard about some of the problems with dioxin --
- 10 furans, PCBs and PHH -- PAH, which is polycyclic aromatic
- 11 hydrocarbons.
- 12 Additional hazardous chemicals are used in
- 13 synthetic number, too numerous to list at this time. Many
- 14 of these substances are typically not naturally found in
- 15 coal, so if they're using coal at the cement kilns there's
- 16 not as much pollution as coal plus tires.
- 17 I can list -- but they produce toxic emissions of
- 18 things that are carcinogenic, mutagenic and teratogenic
- 19 chemicals. Teratogenic chemicals disrupt normal fetal
- 20 development. So I'm very concerned about these things.
- 21 The fact that the synthetic rubber industry uses
- 22 large volumes of so many toxic chemicals in their process is
- 23 testimony to the issue that burning tires, even in
- 24 relatively well controlled combustion devices, may result in
- 25 harmful emissions and cause undesirable impacts in the

- 1 neighboring communities.
- 2 Cement kilns are not designed, constructed or
- 3 intended to be used as scrap tire incinerators. They're
- 4 regulated as cement manufacturing facilities under different
- 5 rules --
- 6 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Doctor, the three minutes are
- 7 up. If you could just sum up for us, please.
- 8 DR. ALBRIGHT: What?
- 9 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: The three minutes were up. If
- 10 you could sum up for us, please. Just to be fair to
- 11 everybody else.
- 12 DR. ALBRIGHT: Well, I went on and I listed all
- 13 sorts of chemicals that are there. And I just feel -- I
- 14 just want to finish by saying cement kilns are one of the
- 15 largest sources of dioxin emissions in the United States.
- 16 And then to add tire burning to that makes it even worse.
- 17 Many people who live downwind of cement plants,
- 18 this one of the problems where I live, carry unhealthy
- 19 burdens of toxic already. And then if you start burning
- 20 these tires it adds to them.
- I hope you will really consider that.
- 22 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: We will, thank you very much.
- 23 The next speaker, Ruth Sethe.
- MS. SPEAKER: (Inaudible.) Joyce Eden --
- 25 MS. EDEN: Thank you. I'm Joyce Eden, West Valley

- 1 Citizens Air Watch.
- Okay, just real briefly, on the -- the cement kiln
- 3 in Cupertino did a test burn. They used coal as their fuel.
- 4 They added 10 percent tires to that. They did a test burn.
- 5 Our group and others and the Integrated Waste Management
- 6 Board and -- I'm sorry, the Bay Area Air Quality Management
- 7 Board, and Silicon Valley Toxic Coalition all studied those
- 8 emissions.
- 9 And just to give you a quick idea, benzene
- 10 increased by 12 percent adding tires to the coal.
- 11 Hexavalent chromium increased 800 percent. That's the Erin
- 12 Brockavich emission. And lead increased 600 percent.
- 13 Now, as far as the specifics that we came here for
- 14 today, SB-876, the goal is recycling. And if there's one
- 15 thing I'd like you to remember from today, tire burning for
- 16 fuel is not recycling. Please look, if you need reminding,
- 17 of the California Public Resources Code definition for
- 18 recycling. In that Code, PRC-40180, recycling does not
- 19 include transformation. Transformation is tire burning for
- 20 fuel.
- 21 So, this -- again there is funding in the five-
- 22 year plan and in the two-year plan supporting, and in the
- 23 Integrated Waste Management Board budget, supporting tire
- 24 burning for fuel, especially in cement kilns. This is
- 25 completely inappropriate.

```
1 You're probably familiar with your Public
```

- 2 Resources Code on recycling which has a three-tier, source
- 3 reduction, recycling and I just reminded you of what the
- 4 real -- that transformation is not recycling. And the last
- 5 lower part of the hierarchy, which is very clear in the
- 6 California Code, is landfill and transformation.
- 7 So this Board should, at this point, be completely
- 8 turning away from transformation, tire-derived fuel, phasing
- 9 it out over a three-year period.
- 10 And I'm really glad to hear people today from the
- 11 rubberized asphalt concrete industry. This Board actually,
- 12 the Integrated Waste Management Board, in one of its reports
- 13 not too many years ago, said that all the 30 million tires
- 14 in California, used tires, could be completely used by
- 15 rubberized asphalt concrete alone. And as you know, there's
- 16 many other true recycling uses for them.
- 17 So we don't really have to look very far. We
- 18 don't have to do a lot of studying. We just need to
- 19 implement that and put more money into the programs that you
- 20 already have there. And the playground mats and so on.
- 21 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: I'm going to have to interrupt
- 22 here for --
- MS. EDEN: Okay.
- 24 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: -- a second. I do know that
- 25 Board Member Washington needs to leave at this point. We

1 will lose our quorum, and so for those that wish to remain

- 2 and testify, it will be recorded. However, there will be
- 3 another opportunity. This Committee, with a full quorum,
- 4 will reconvene after a ten-day period so that we can
- 5 finalize everything that we have here. So you'll have an
- 6 opportunity there again to testify before our Committee.
- 7 For those of you who have taken the time to travel
- 8 and be with us today, Board Member Paparian and I will
- 9 remain to hear your testimony. However, if you wish to not
- 10 remain after we lose our quorum, you will be welcome to come
- 11 to our meeting that will take place a little after ten days,
- 12 to record your testimony, at which time it will be
- 13 transcribed.
- MS. EDEN: Thank you. Can I continue?
- Okay, as far as the enforcement section of the
- 16 staff recommendation revisions, there were 785 sites that
- 17 were identified, 576 were taken care of in some way. In the
- 18 five-year plan they listed 209 active sites. And obviously
- 19 we don't have the time now, but I'd like to know what the --
- 20 I think the staff would, if they haven't yet, updated the
- 21 Board on the status of those. We recommend that happens.
- 22 And also the citizens would like to know.
- 23 The California Highway Patrol has identified 279
- 24 sites, illegal tire piles, from aerial surveillance; 103
- 25 have been taken care of by the Integrated Waste Management

1 Board in some manner. That leaves 176 sites yet to be

- 2 cleaned up.
- 3 Our recommendation, we'd like the Board to
- 4 recommend to the staff is that these sites, they're already
- 5 identified, they be cleaned up on a short-term basis, within
- 6 the year.
- 7 Then we also recommend that the bounty be funded,
- 8 the amnesty be funded, and I'm not sure, maybe we missed the
- 9 discussion on that. But why the staff is recommending
- 10 reduction in that, perhaps it just needs more local
- 11 community education. But that seems like a really good
- 12 idea. So I'd like to see that funded well.
- We want permitted facilities -- the staff is
- 14 recommending, or I think it was in the five-year plan, that
- 15 they be brought into compliance by 2006. This is way too
- 16 long, way, way too long. So, --
- 17 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: I wonder if you could, because
- 18 we are meeting again, this Committee will meet again, I
- 19 wonder if you could hand these in to us in written form?
- MS. EDEN: Yes, I will.
- 21 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Then we would have them before
- 22 the meeting.
- 23 MS. EDEN: Okay, well, just can I make --
- 24 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: If you could sum up, please.
- 25 MS. EDEN: -- two quick -- yeah, I'll just make

- 1 two quick points.
- 2 We want the plan revised for no exemption/
- 3 exception for storage for tires at cement kilns. And then,
- 4 okay, then Martha Gildard mentioned \$1 million going towards
- 5 tire-derived fuel from the Integrated Waste Management
- 6 Board. And we would like a report or listing of exactly who
- 7 got that money, and how much each company received.
- 8 Obviously we feel that's inappropriate and that should be
- 9 phased out.
- 10 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, thank you very much.
- MS. EDEN: Thank you.
- 12 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: We do need to go --
- MS. EDEN: Thank you.
- 14 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: -- on to the next speaker. The
- 15 next speaker is Donna Liu.
- 16 MS. LIU: Chairman Medina, Members of the Board,
- 17 good afternoon. My name is Donna Liu; I'm with the Natural
- 18 Resources Defense Council.
- 19 I'd like to bring your attention to a related tire
- 20 issue. This one similarly addressing the intent of SB-876
- 21 and its public health and air quality goals, and alluded to
- 22 this morning by Martha, and again by Mr. Sims.
- In the state's desire to develop more petroleum
- 24 reduction strategies and thus protect air quality and the
- 25 public health of all Californians, SB-1170, sponsored by

- 1 Byron Sher, directed the CEC to explore and produce
- 2 recommendations on ways to improve the fuel efficiency of
- 3 vehicle tires.
- 4 Tire efficiency, or rolling resistance, has to do
- 5 with how much friction there is between the tire and the
- 6 road, and the efficiency of the tire in operation.
- 7 Currently, tires which come with new cars are more
- 8 efficient than those tires for sale in the replacement tire
- 9 market. This is because car companies count on low rolling
- 10 resistance tires to help meet their fuel economy standards.
- 11 Yet tire companies are not obligated in any way to provide
- 12 more efficient tires in the replacement tire market.
- 13 Therefore, there is no baseline efficiency required for
- 14 replacement tires. And consumers who may want to replace
- 15 their tires with the same tires that came with their car
- 16 cannot find those tires in the after-market.
- 17 Low rolling resistance tires can lead to a fuel
- 18 economy improvement of roughly 3 percent, which, as you
- 19 know, is highly significant. Californians could save
- 20 upwards to 300 million gallons of gasoline annually.
- 21 Realistically, if low rolling resistance tires
- 22 penetrated only 25 to 30 percent of the consumer market, gas
- 23 consumption could be reduced by 77- to 107-million gallons
- 24 per year. The year's savings to California consumers would
- 25 then result in roughly \$118- to \$165-million.

1 Because low rolling resistance tires are largely

- 2 unavailable, fuel efficiency significantly declines.
- 3 Additionally, consumers are unaware that the replacement
- 4 tires they buy for their vehicles can impact fuel economy.
- 5 An increase of only \$9 to \$22 in tire purchasing can result
- 6 in \$87 to \$260 of fuel over ten years and two sets of tires.
- 7 And that is only if those more efficient tires are sold in
- 8 California.
- 9 Finally, evidence suggests no strong correlations
- 10 between rolling resistance and longevity. Therefore,
- 11 efforts to improve tire fuel efficiency can and should
- 12 operate hand-in-hand with the state's efforts to minimize
- 13 tire waste.
- 14 You have now before you a report from the
- 15 California Energy Commission Staff and their summary of
- 16 findings and recommendations on creating a fuel efficient
- 17 tire program in the state. Among other things, the Energy
- 18 Commission is recommending, creation of a database of tire
- 19 efficiency based on testing, which would be carried out over
- 20 the next two years; creation of consumer tire fuel
- 21 efficiency rating system; exploration of consumer education
- 22 approaches; and exploration of incentive programs to
- 23 encourage the purchase of more fuel efficient tires.
- 24 The program requests funding of \$700,000 for the
- 25 first two years to establish a database of 1400 tires; and

1 that would include testing and analysis. After which time

- 2 enough data will have been collected to determine minimum
- 3 efficiency guidelines.
- 4 We now ask that this Committee consider using less
- 5 than two cents from the dollar fee collected on every tire
- 6 toward establishing a tire efficiency program in California.
- 7 Doing so would protect our air quality, help achieve public
- 8 health goals, and support the state's petroleum reduction
- 9 strategies.
- 10 Thank you.
- 11 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, thank you.
- 12 BOARD MEMBER: Mr. Chairman, could I just ask a
- 13 couple points?
- 14 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Certainly.
- 15 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Martha, one of the things
- 16 that this witness just mentioned is that the Energy
- 17 Commission program to develop a database of 1400 tires with
- 18 regards to their rolling resistance.
- 19 I know that we participated in some of these
- 20 Energy Commission workshops. Are we trying to assure that
- 21 that database includes information on the longevity of these
- 22 tires?
- MS. GILDART: Yes. Staff has participated in
- 24 those workshops, as has the contractor that we have working
- 25 on the longer-lived tires. I wasn't so sure if the recycled

1 content tire gentleman had participated. Yes, okay, yes.

- 2 To get that on the tape.
- 3 It is sort of a three-way problem, emphasizing one
- 4 over the other. How does it shift --
- 5 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Yeah, my question, I mean
- 6 I understand some tires may have, you know, high rolling
- 7 resistance and low life and some might have higher life.
- 8 But it sounds like this information is intended ultimately
- 9 to provide some benefit to the consumer.
- 10 MS. LIU: Right. The data was requested by the
- 11 trade association for the tire makers. The data was not
- 12 provided by the tire makers. Therefore, the state has the
- onus of testing those tires, themselves.
- 14 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Right. So, if we could
- 15 get into that database information on the longevity of those
- 16 tires, I think that would be an added benefit, so that
- 17 someone using the list could actually see. You know, for
- 18 example, our state procurement folks could see information
- 19 that has both longevity and rolling resistance information.
- 20 And I think that, you know, it would provide vital
- 21 information to assure that both goals are met to the highest
- 22 extent possible.
- 23 MS. LIU: That very idea has been recommended by
- 24 Energy Commission Staff. It's just a matter of kind of
- 25 developing the link between the Energy Commission and the

- 1 Integrated Waste Management Staff.
- 2 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: I think with some of the
- 3 funding that I suggested this morning we could maybe use
- 4 some of that funding to help develop that information.
- 5 The other thing that you mentioned was you weren't
- 6 aware of the correlation between rolling resistance and we
- 7 don't have good information? Why don't you repeat what you
- 8 said.
- 9 MS. LIU: We haven't been able to find any
- 10 extensive study which would show that there is any
- 11 significant tradeoff between rolling resistance and
- 12 longevity. There are some studies in Europe and there are
- 13 some very -- we did some small studies as a phase effort for
- 14 the Energy Commission report that's before the Commission
- 15 now; that was just approved by them.
- 16 But there was -- we don't have enough data really,
- 17 so --
- 18 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Okay, so some of our
- 19 research money could be used to help develop that
- 20 information --
- MS. LIU: Yes.
- 22 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: -- including what it might
- 23 take to meet both goals, longer life and better rolling
- 24 resistance.
- MS. LIU: Exactly.

```
1 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Okay.
```

- 2 MS. GILDART: And the recycled content. As I
- 3 said, it's a sort of a three-way balancing point.
- 4 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Right.
- 5 MS. LIU: So at this time we just ask that the
- 6 consideration of a \$700,000 program be funded by this
- 7 Committee.
- 8 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Okay. Thank you.
- 9 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Is there any way to identify
- 10 these tires?
- 11 MS. LIU: I'm sorry?
- 12 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Is there any way that these
- 13 tires can be identified if you're looking for a low rolling
- 14 resistance tire?
- 15 MS. LIU: We would love to have direction from the
- 16 tire manufacturers. Although they are telling us that they
- 17 do not test tires that are not specific to the original
- 18 equipment, the OEM tires that come with new vehicles.
- 19 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, thank you very much for
- 20 your testimony.
- 21 MS. GILDART: Chairman Paparian -- I'm sorry,
- 22 Chairman Medina.
- 23 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Yeah.
- MS. GILDART: The gentleman from the Nevada
- 25 Automotive Test Center who is doing the study on the

1 recycled content would like to respond to her comments. Is

- 2 that permissible or --
- 3 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: At this point, why not.
- 4 MS. GILDART: Okay.
- 5 MR. SIME: I just wanted to comment on the --
- 6 sorry, my name is Muluneh Sime with Nevada Automotive Test
- 7 Center.
- 8 I just wanted to comment the relationship between
- 9 rolling resistance and the longevity issue. Essentially
- 10 what rolling resistance generates, you know, within the
- 11 tire, is increased internal heat which affects the life of
- 12 the tire.
- 13 So one could, in general terms, without saying by
- 14 this amount or by this rate, increased rolling resistance
- 15 would impact negatively on the life span of the tire.
- 16 I just wanted to make that clarification. From a
- 17 technical standpoint that is a kind of established
- 18 information. Just wanted to comment on that.
- 19 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you. The next person is
- 20 Sudheer Helekar.
- 21 MR. HELEKAR: My name is Sudheer Helekar. I
- 22 represent Advanced Recycling Sciences. I've given my
- 23 PowerPoint presentation to the Board Members, to Ms. French,
- 24 and so I'm not going to go through all of that. I'm just
- 25 going to make it short.

1 I've been working with tire and auto industry for

- 2 the last several years, along with Rubber Equipment
- 3 Association in Phoenix, Arizona.
- 4 My major point is all this recycling activities we
- 5 are doing the past several years, we are just trying to use
- 6 rubber as a material which is like a base material. Rubber
- 7 is really a polymer. You have to look at it as a polymer
- 8 and not just a base material that you can add to it.
- 9 For example, you take mats, you make the mats by
- 10 adding adhesives to that. Those mats are not going to have
- 11 that kind of a life that you'd like to see in long term.
- 12 Similar things that you use, with just the rubber without
- 13 adhesives, they're not going to get long-term life and long-
- 14 term product quality. In long term, it's going to come back
- 15 to you and say, well, we spent all this money and now we re-
- 16 do it.
- 17 You have to look at polymers as a polymer, and you
- 18 need to understand and do more research about polymers. For
- 19 example, you take cars, they use a lot of plastic parts.
- 20 You open the trunk of the car, everything you see there is
- 21 all plastic. You have a car accident, everything then
- 22 breaks down. It's all in pieces. You have to replace all
- 23 that.
- 24 You can replace those parts with a compound of
- 25 plastic and rubber in such a way, with the polymer

1 composition, that they will not break. They will bend, but

- 2 you can re-shape back. There's a lot of market in auto
- 3 industry.
- 4 If you want to really recycle products, you want
- 5 to look at a large market and long-term usage. And from
- 6 that point of view I suggest we should look at polymer
- 7 compounding, including what I call liquid rubber, which you
- 8 can take rubber and you can process it by de-vulcanizing in
- 9 such a way that you can re-use to make new tires. I have
- 10 the data that shows the specifics of that material will
- 11 match the specifics used for the new tires. That is a
- 12 better usage than what we are doing right now.
- 13 And for that, we need to understand more about
- 14 polymers. We need to have more data. If you say let's go
- 15 get that data, you are going to have a hundred scientists
- 16 coming to you tomorrow and say, I want to do research.
- 17 Every university would want to do the research. I mean,
- 18 where do we stop?
- 19 What you have to do is you have to say, well, you
- 20 give me the data, you give me the proof that your process
- 21 works, then we'll help you to go to the next step. Because
- 22 anything, you know, any technology development, like you had
- 23 a recently applied technology program. You went straight to
- 24 commercialization. You can't go straight. It's a three-
- 25 phase program.

1 One is you have to do fundamental research; you

- 2 had to put the polymers, insure the demonstration of the
- 3 data that your process works, your components work.
- 4 Then you have to go to a second phase where you
- 5 apply that to specific products of specific application.
- 6 Because for tire manufacturers say, okay, I'm going to use
- 7 200,000 tires from next year from you, they have to have
- 8 specific application data tested. So that's the second
- 9 phase.
- 10 If the second phase is proven, then it's easy for
- 11 them to say we'll buy your material for 300,000 tires, or
- 12 whatever what it is. But to do that you had to go to second
- 13 phase.
- 14 So I recommend essentially that you set up a
- 15 program, not just a commercialization product,
- 16 commercialization, but the phase before that that allows you
- 17 to demonstration kind of a phase. Because that allows
- 18 smaller companies to take that material -- because it takes
- 19 costing people million dollars to develop the technology.
- 20 That comes from their pocket.
- 21 If you go to the next --
- 22 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you, if you could --
- MR. HELEKAR: -- phase, you need another people's
- 24 million dollars, so you need support there.
- 25 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you, if you could

- 1 conclude, we'd appreciate --
- 2 MR. HELEKAR: I'm done.
- 3 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: -- because you have --
- 4 MR. HELEKAR: Thank you.
- 5 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: -- handed in written remarks.
- 6 Thank you very much.
- 7 Jerry Coffin, please. Next speaker, Jerry Coffin.
- 8 MR. COFFIN: My name is Jerry Coffin, and when you
- 9 announced that there was a three-minute limit I turned to
- 10 Linda Dickinson and I said, generally it takes me more than
- 11 three minutes to introduce myself.
- 12 The reason that I'm here is because our company,
- 13 Tire Conversion Technologies, wishes to build a factory in
- 14 the State of California to use California waste tires to
- 15 manufacture value-added products to sell into the
- 16 marketplace.
- Now we're not talking about experimental --
- 18 anything experimental. We're talking about actual products,
- 19 actual customers, and if I read the brochure I would have
- 20 seen that this is all supposed to be on two sides. But
- 21 somebody may want to bootleg one of these copies over there;
- 22 there's three copies of some of our advertising material.
- 23 Showing some of our top ten consumers, all out of our
- 24 demonstration plant which was built in Scotia, New York,
- 25 near Albany, New York.

1 My family is a California family. We came here in

- 2 1921. And my parents were both California school teachers.
- 3 My father was an auto shop teacher and he invented the
- 4 process which we use to manufacture these industrial
- 5 products.
- 6 The pilot plant was built in New York because
- 7 that's where I happen to be. And we have discovered that
- 8 New York is not a terrifically friendly place to do
- 9 business. And I wanted to come back to the state that I
- 10 grew up in, and play in the water that I played in, and walk
- 11 on the beaches that I walked on.
- 12 And so we decided to build our first 12-million
- 13 tire facility in California. Now, that 12-million tire
- 14 facility can be translated into 300 jobs; or we can break it
- down into modules of 3-million tire facilities.
- 16 So our concern is in two areas. One is what can
- 17 be done within this plan to increase the demand side. For
- 18 instance, one of the products we make is a snow plow blade
- 19 edge that is superior in every aspect to those that are
- 20 currently used. It's sold at the same price point as what's
- 21 currently used. And by some judicious support we could get
- 22 the Caltrans snow plows to be using these and increase the
- 23 demand. Every small truck snow plow uses four tires. We
- 24 recycle 97 percent of the tire at this point.
- 25 The additional area that's of concern to us is the

1 capital area. We're not talking about something that you

- 2 build in your garage. Dealing with tires involves large
- 3 machines. Even though we're labor intensive and we need to
- 4 be labor intensive to get the quality that we need, it's a
- 5 substantial investment to build the kind of factory that's
- 6 noise free and completely emissions free. We've done that
- 7 in New York and we know what the expenses are.
- 8 So, there's a number of areas which we support
- 9 very strongly. One is, oddly enough, civil engineering uses
- 10 because we do grind up our steel-free sidewalls. And track
- 11 and other recreational surfaces, we have under testing right
- 12 now at the State University of New York in Albany, using our
- 13 material which looks like a black board -- normally I have a
- 14 piece with me -- as the undersurface of Astroturf, as a way
- 15 of preventing athletic injuries.
- 16 So, support of various new product development
- 17 materials is vital to us.
- 18 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: As you wrap up I had a -- I'm
- 19 sure you've been in touch with our staff, and I think that
- 20 you'll find answers to a couple of your questions. I think
- 21 that on the demand side, as the tire program becomes more
- 22 integrated with our state agency Buy Recycled Campaign, that
- 23 hopefully we'll see things, you know, as you identify uses
- 24 like snow plows, which we may not have known about, I don't
- 25 know, we'll be able to work more to make sure that in the

- 1 Buy Recycled Campaign that state agencies have to
- 2 participate in, that we're able to incorporate that.
- 3 You've probably already heard about our loan
- 4 programs; the RMDZ loan program. I think when you're
- 5 introduced to the RMDZ folks you'll find that they are aware
- 6 of other loan programs that are out there like the Pollution
- 7 Control Finance Authority and others that you might not yet
- 8 be aware of.
- 9 So I think that you're doing a good job working
- 10 with our staff; and I think that they do a good job of
- 11 providing some of this important information about how to
- 12 get your business going.
- MR. COFFIN: It's a world of difference from New
- 14 York, let me tell you.
- 15 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay.
- MR. COFFIN: A world of difference. And the
- 17 difference is positive. It's my intention to try to speak
- 18 individually with some of you, to actually show you the
- 19 product so that you can continue to encourage the
- 20 development of value-added manufacturing of what is, in
- 21 fact, a resource, not trash.
- Thank you.
- 23 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: That would be most welcome and
- 24 thank you for your testimony.
- 25 The next speaker is Joyce Eden.

```
1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (inaudible).
```

- 2 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Dr. Barry Takallou.
- 3 DR. TAKALLOU: Good afternoon, Member Medina,
- 4 Member Paparian. I'm Barry Takallou from CRM Company. I
- 5 would like, on behalf of California Asphalt Pavement
- 6 Association, which I'm Chairing the Rubber Asphalt Concrete
- 7 Committee, I would like to express our full support of
- 8 immediate implementation of SB-1346, funding of SB-1346, and
- 9 use up any unused money in providing support to local
- 10 agencies for expansion of rubberized asphalt market.
- I just passed it on to you, the news release by
- 12 Governor Hall from the State of Arizona, which they have
- 13 announced expansion of their program. It provided extra \$34
- 14 million this year for increasing the consumption of asphalt
- 15 rubber in the State of Arizona.
- 16 As you can see on this news release they show 115
- 17 additional miles of rubberized asphalt is going to be paved
- 18 with rubberized asphalt in the State of Arizona.
- 19 And also you have a press release from Governor
- 20 Davis which announces completion of I-880, one of the
- 21 largest rubberized asphalt project in the United States.
- 22 Finally, I would like to bring to your attention
- 23 some of the international activities. The European Union
- 24 just announced, as of July 16, 2003, they are not going to
- 25 allow any whole tire into the landfill. And also directive

1 would go on, on 2006, any type of shredded, even the crumb,

- 2 rubber cannot go to the landfill in any size and form and
- 3 shape.
- 4 And 2008, the incineration of the tires in cement
- 5 plants are forbidden in European Union.
- 6 I would like -- this came on a scrap tire news
- 7 magazine, this is a review. So we don't have to copy in all
- 8 other countries, but we know we are the fifth largest
- 9 economy in the world. According to this data it looks like
- 10 we're the sixth country as far as tire diversion, so I think
- 11 the program coming along very well. Staff done a
- 12 magnificent job of diverting over 75 percent of the waste
- 13 tires from landfill. But still we are, according some of
- 14 this data, we are the sixth in the world, so we are hoping
- 15 we can change that and go to number one.
- 16 And, again, I would like, in any of the allocation
- 17 of the money be sensitive to other global activities. For
- 18 instance, it shows Sweden, they are re-diverting hundred
- 19 percent of their tires. I think a quick study would be good
- 20 to see what other countries are doing, and what's, how they
- 21 do 100 percent taking away tires from the land.
- Thank you very much for your time.
- 23 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you, Dr. Takallou. And I
- 24 know from my experience in working with the Arizona
- 25 Department of Transportation that they are very committed to

1 the use of rubberized asphalt. And, in fact, they were a

- 2 very good example for us when I was at Caltrans.
- 3 DR. TAKALLOU: This support not came, you know,
- 4 following of the public opinion on asphalt rubber. Actually
- 5 this is public got behind asphalt rubber because of the
- 6 merits of asphalt rubber on ride-ability, noise reduction.
- 7 And maybe we should take this case to the taxpayer of the
- 8 State of California and see what they want to do.
- 9 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you.
- DR. TAKALLOU: Thank you very much.
- 11 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Next speaker is Jane Crue from
- 12 the California District Attorneys Association.
- 13 MS. CRUE: Chairman Medina, Board Member Paparian.
- 14 My name is Jane Crue. I'm the Waste Tire Circuit Prosecutor
- 15 with the California District Attorneys Association.
- 16 And I just have a quick comment about the wording
- 17 of the budget table for the enforcement and regulations
- 18 section.
- 19 I just have a concern with the wording saying LEA
- 20 enforcement jurisdiction grants. Under that table there. I
- 21 know that the CDAA grant that waste tire circuit prosecutor
- 22 project runs under was funded under that section.
- 23 And my concern is that someone may believe that
- 24 that money is only available for LEA programs, not for other
- 25 type of enforcement programs. And so I don't know if

1 there's some way to reword that to make it a little more

- 2 clear on that.
- 3 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: I'd support that. I think
- 4 what the CDAA program is doing is a good complement to our
- 5 enforcement efforts and want to make sure that it's, you
- 6 know, that it won't be easily confused by a future Board.
- 7 MS. CRUE: Right, right, that's my only comment.
- 8 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Yeah, your presence here
- 9 reminds me of something that came up in some of the -- one
- 10 of the workshops and I'm not sure if it's covered here or
- 11 not, but we had talked at one point about purchasing and
- 12 then providing surveillance equipment on loan for
- 13 enforcement-related efforts.
- 14 Would that be part of the enforcement jurisdiction
- 15 grants, or do we need to come up with another line item for
- 16 that? It's something we talked about in one of the
- workshops.
- 18 MR. SPEAKER: -- with the tire enforcement branch,
- 19 again. That, in fact, is one of the things that is an
- 20 allowable item under the grants that we give to local
- 21 agencies for the purchase of surveillance equipment.
- 22 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Right.
- MR. SPEAKER: And that's provided for.
- 24 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Yeah, the additional
- 25 concept that had come up was the possibility of us

1 purchasing surveillance equipment that could be loaned to a

- 2 jurisdiction that maybe only needs it for a two- or three-
- 3 month period. And then we would get it back. Similar to
- 4 what the Air Resources Board does with some of their
- 5 surveillance equipment.
- 6 MR. SPEAKER: We're thinking about that. That
- 7 hasn't made its way into this proposal at this point, yet,
- 8 though.
- 9 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: If that was desirable
- 10 would we need a different line item, or could we include
- 11 that? Would that be part of enforcement jurisdiction
- 12 grants?
- 13 Actually enforcement jurisdiction grants implies
- 14 that we're giving it to a jurisdiction, --
- MR. SPEAKER: Correct.
- 16 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: -- so we may need a
- 17 different line item if that's desirable.
- 18 MR. SPEAKER: Correct.
- 19 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: So maybe we can talk about
- 20 that at this next workshop, whether we need to pull out some
- 21 number, you know, off the top of my head, a quarter million
- 22 or something, to, you know, purchase and maintain some
- 23 equipment. But, Don, I'll look to some of your guidance --
- MR. SPEAKER: Sure.
- 25 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: -- as to the desirability

1 of that. I've certainly heard it from some folks. And I

- 2 think we talked about it at one point, too.
- 3 MS. CRUE: I've heard the same thing from the CHP
- 4 folks that are working in the enforcement, tire enforcement
- 5 program.
- 6 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: That some occasional use
- 7 of surveillance --
- 8 MS. CRUE: Right, that --
- 9 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: -- would be helpful?
- 10 MS. CRUE: -- that they've needed equipment to be
- 11 available from somewhere. And so I think that would be
- 12 great.
- 13 MR. SPEAKER: We think we can -- that would
- 14 probably be best just to add it to the staff line item, you
- 15 know. The intent can be called out in the plan. And then
- 16 we can just develop that under the staff item.
- 17 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Okay.
- 18 MR. SPEAKER: Enhance the enforcement staff line
- 19 item.
- 20 MS. TOBIAS: I think we could come back to you --
- 21 Catherine Tobias -- with this. I'd already spoken to Jane
- 22 about her concerns on this. You know, when the tire plan
- 23 was done several years ago we were a little bit less certain
- 24 about where our enforcement was going to take place and how
- 25 we were going to do it. So I think staff can come back to

- 1 the next meeting and have some proposals for you.
- 2 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Thank you.
- 3 MS. CRUE: Thank you.
- 4 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you. This meeting will
- 5 adjourn at 3:00. We have eight remaining speakers; that's
- 6 exactly three minutes apiece in order to finish at 3:00, so
- 7 the clock will be running.
- 8 The first speaker is Michael Theroux.
- 9 MR. THEROUX: Thank you, Committee Chair Medina
- 10 and Board Member Paparian. I will keep this to a couple of
- 11 procedural requests, and then submit written comment at our
- 12 next meeting rather than try to dive into details today.
- 13 I would ask, because of that, because we do need
- 14 to prepare for that, that the work that was done, the
- 15 transcripts for today, be quickly put up available. And
- 16 that including the attendance lists, if possible. And that
- 17 the changes in particular that have been suggested today be
- 18 made available so that we can work with those on the public
- 19 side, and participate fully in developing written comment
- 20 for the next time around.
- 21 But I appreciate the opportunity to take a second
- 22 stab at this in a few days and I think it certainly warrants
- 23 that.
- 24 One further point, there is -- I am very pleased
- 25 to see the interaction between the Public Utilities

1 Commission now and the Integrated Waste Management Board on

- 2 some of these very difficult issues. And there are hearings
- 3 that are coming up during the week of February 17th that
- 4 have to do with our renewable portfolio standard.
- 5 I bring this up for one specific point. Board
- 6 Member Paparian, I would agree with you that just generating
- 7 energy is not enough. And the health questions are
- 8 certainly pertinent.
- 9 In context of AB-2770 in particular, that bill is
- 10 working its way, as conditioning language, into the
- 11 renewable portfolio standard right now. The concept of
- 12 having both technology- and performance-base is appropriate
- 13 at this time for implementation of that portion of the bill.
- 14 It is certainly a timely matter to address interagency.
- 15 Other than that, thank you. Wonderful workshop
- 16 today, and I will look forward to our next shot at this in a
- 17 few days.
- 18 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, thank you. Next speaker
- 19 Galen Baker.
- 20 MR. BAKER: I'm Galen Baker with the California
- 21 Prison Industry Authority. And I'd like to thank you for
- 22 this opportunity to address you today.
- We have put together a tentative proposal for your
- 24 staff, and I'd like to give you a little bit of background
- 25 about what the Prison Industry Authority is, so you can

1 understand what we are and why we are coming to you for this

- 2 assistance.
- 3 PIA is a self-sustaining, self-supporting inmate
- 4 work program.
- 5 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Mr. Baker, we're very familiar
- 6 with the Prison Industry Authority.
- 7 MR. BAKER: Great.
- 8 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: We're always ordering furniture
- 9 and other supplies from your Authority. So we're very
- 10 familiar. And we spend our money there.
- 11 MR. BAKER: Thank you, we appreciate your support.
- 12 Basically we're currently looking at the use of
- 13 the crumb rubber to create products which are going to be
- 14 used ultimately by Caltrans and other entities such as LAX,
- 15 who are currently using these on a much smaller basis.
- 16 If we are going to proceed with this process, as
- 17 indicated previously, this is a very expensive and a large-
- 18 scale operation. We're looking at approximately \$3 million
- 19 in initial capital outlay, without any other ongoing cost
- 20 consideration.
- 21 As we must be a self-supporting entity, any
- 22 support that we can get from the Integrated Waste Management
- 23 Board is a material part of that fiscal calculation which
- 24 will allow us to move forward and create not only the inmate
- 25 work programs and the inmate jobs and training, but also the

- 1 public benefit for the State of California.
- 2 We appreciate the effort of all the Integrated
- 3 Waste Management Staff, and your efforts, and we hope to
- 4 work with you in the future as we develop a more complete,
- 5 more comprehensive proposal.
- 6 Thank you for your time.
- 7 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you. Vicki Kramer.
- 8 MS. KRAMER: Good afternoon, I'm Vicki Kramer with
- 9 the California Department of Health Services. And I'm also
- 10 speaking on behalf of John Stroh with the Mosquito and
- 11 Vector Control Association, as he had to leave at noon.
- 12 As was alluded to earlier, when water collects in
- 13 tires an ideal habitat is created for the aquatic immature
- 14 stage of the mosquito. When the mosquito emerges as an
- 15 adult it infests surrounding areas, bites people and
- 16 potentially carries disease.
- 17 Of immediate concern is the potential role of
- 18 waste tires in the introduction and establishment of West
- 19 Nile Virus in California. This mosquito-borne virus was
- 20 first introduced into the United Airlines in 1999 in New
- 21 York City. And since then has spread to 43 states.
- 22 Last year there were over 4000 severe cases of
- 23 West Nile Virus. Only one in 150 cases are detected or have
- 24 severe illness, so many many people were ill last year; over
- 25 150 died.

1 Waste tires also play a role in the introduction

- 2 and spread of exotic mosquito species. In 2000 the Asian
- 3 tiger mosquito was introduced into California from China in
- 4 shipments of Lucky bamboo. And despite eradication efforts
- 5 last year, we found the Asian tiger mosquito in discarded
- 6 tires in Los Angeles County. So certainly there is a
- 7 significant impact on public health.
- 8 (End tape 3A.)
- 9 MS. KRAMER: -- in collaboration with the Mosquito
- 10 and Vector Control Association of California has submitted
- 11 two proposals to you, and has indicated some funding has
- 12 been allocated to address public health issues surrounding
- 13 mosquitos and tires in California.
- 14 Specifically, we know very little about the
- 15 abundance and species composition of mosquitos breeding in
- 16 tires. We need to learn about the seasonal cycles of these
- 17 mosquitos, regional differences, so that we can focus our
- 18 control efforts most effectively; and then therefore best
- 19 use our limited resources.
- 20 So that I believe through allocating these funds
- 21 we will gain a better understanding of what's going on with
- 22 the mosquitos and tires in California; be able to focus
- 23 control efforts; and therefore, pass this information on to
- 24 public health campaigns, whether it be ours or in
- 25 conjunction with another group, to inform the public that

1 these tires are not only an environmental hazard, but also

- 2 pose a health threat to their families and their
- 3 neighborhoods.
- 4 And ultimately we hope to, of course, reduce the
- 5 public health threat, as well as the number of illegally
- 6 discarded tires in California.
- 7 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Could I ask you a quick
- 8 question?
- 9 MS. KRAMER: Sure.
- 10 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: In your experience in
- 11 doing this type of research in the past, is it typically
- 12 private consultants that do this type of research? Or is it
- 13 public -- universities?
- 14 MS. KRAMER: No, there's nobody in the private
- 15 sector doing this kind of work.
- 16 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: So it's university type
- 17 research?
- 18 MS. KRAMER: This kind of work is -- well, this
- 19 kind of work is actually done fairly typically by the
- 20 Department of Health Services in conjunction with local
- 21 agencies.
- 22 We have a similar agreement right now with the
- 23 California Department of Transportation --
- 24 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: But you actually do this
- 25 research to find --

- 1 MS. KRAMER: Right.
- 2 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Okay. That's what I
- 3 wanted to know, thank you.
- 4 MS. KRAMER: The universities might look at
- 5 focused control technologies, but not do generalized
- 6 surveillance in conjunction with a lot of local agencies.
- 7 And we tie that into control methods and education
- 8 and so on. So, I would just like to encourage you to
- 9 maintain the level of funding suggested by the staff. It's
- 10 less than we actually requested. And, if at all possible,
- 11 increase that level of funding. We'd like funding for at
- 12 least three years to develop an effective project.
- Thank you.
- 14 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Okay, thank you. Killer bees,
- 15 tiger mosquitos, what next?
- Mr. George Larson, Lakin Tire.
- 17 MR. LARSON: Thank you, Mr. Chair, Mr. Medina --
- 18 Mr. Paparian. I have two quick points.
- 19 I know the focus of today's discussions have been
- 20 primarily on allocation of budget monies, but I would
- 21 request on behalf of my client, Lakin Tire, to take a look
- 22 at the definitional qualifications, or the criteria for
- 23 application for the commercialization of tire grants to
- 24 expand, or at least revise, the current focus on molded
- 25 rubber products.

1 This money, and I also appreciate the fact your

- 2 Committee has recommended continued funding for the next
- 3 five years at the \$2 million level, that's very helpful.
- 4 This is the only money that's available to the private
- 5 sector for market development. So it's very critical to us,
- 6 as having been successful in applying for these grants
- 7 before, we feel that, as a company, Lakin has the
- 8 opportunity to move very large numbers of tires out of the
- 9 waste stream to higher end uses.
- 10 Secondly, I would like to see if staff and the
- 11 Board would consider some funding for the hauling industry
- 12 as it complies with the electronic reporting requirements
- 13 and opportunities that are forthcoming down the line. I
- 14 know your information management group are working on the
- 15 computer base reporting. Lakin Tire has volunteered and we
- 16 are working in conjunction with your staff, as we are the
- 17 largest tire hauler in California.
- We feel it's appropriate and within the scope of
- 19 the intent of SB-876 that the costs that we will bear to
- 20 comply with that mandate are a legitimate expenditure that
- 21 should receive some financial assistance through the monies
- 22 that are generated in this tire grant fund. So I would
- 23 appreciate it if you would take a look at that issue,
- 24 reconsider your allocations.
- 25 Thank you.

1 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you, Mr. Larson. The next

- 2 person is Bill McGavern with Sierra Club.
- 3 MR. McGAVERN: Good afternoon; I'm Bill McGavern
- 4 with Sierra Club California.
- 5 I want to first make a point of process. The
- 6 notice went out that this would be a public workshop, but as
- 7 recently as late Monday the staff were recommending that
- 8 there be no public comment allowed from anyone who had
- 9 participated in the previous meetings. And there also was
- 10 no agenda for this meeting.
- 11 I think one of the strengths of this Board is that
- 12 you do your business in public. However, at your meetings
- 13 there are usually very few representatives of community
- 14 groups. And a process like that, where people don't even
- 15 know if they'll be allowed to comment, let alone when, makes
- 16 it very difficult for community groups, particularly for
- 17 people who need to travel over long distances. And so I
- 18 urge you in the future to do everything you can to invite,
- 19 rather than deter, the input of people representing
- 20 community groups.
- 21 On the substance of the issues you're considering,
- 22 I recognize that the staff proposal would invest most of the
- 23 funding into recycling. However, it is disturbing to hear
- 24 staff continue to talk about tire burning as recycling.
- 25 Tire burning is not recycling. It occupies the low end of

1 the hierarchy and therefore you really shouldn't be putting

- 2 any of this money into tire burning, at least until you've
- 3 exhausted all of the re-use, reduction and recycling
- 4 options. And you haven't even come close to exhausting
- 5 those.
- 6 Therefore, when you take this up again I would
- 7 urge you not to put any money into the tires-as-fuel
- 8 category.
- 9 When it comes to updating the report on pyrolysis
- 10 gassification and liquefaction, I think it's important that
- 11 that report focus on actual emissions data that is supplied
- 12 and evaluated by an independent expert. So that we really
- 13 can learn what the different technologies, and obviously
- 14 we're not talking about one thing here, we're talking about
- 15 very different technologies, what impact they're having on
- 16 the environment and public health. And I think that will be
- 17 very valuable to know.
- 18 And finally, I urge the Board to work with the
- 19 Energy Commission to make sure that the importance of low
- 20 rolling resistance tires is emphasized, along with long life
- 21 and use of recycled materials.
- Thank you.
- 23 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you, Mr. McGavern, your
- 24 points were well taken in regard to public comment. At any
- 25 meeting that, you know, is held publicly, where public

1 notice is given, the public will be invited to come and

- 2 speak.
- 3 And now finally our last speaker for the day, and
- 4 that's Jana Nairn. And we want to thank you for your
- 5 patience for sitting here through the last hour. Thank you.
- 6 MS. NAIRN: No problem. It's nice to be the last
- 7 speaker. At least everyone heard the last, so they woke up
- 8 and said, oh, we're almost done.
- 9 Thank you, Chairman Medina and Board Member
- 10 Paparian. Just briefly, it's a pleasure to be here. I was
- 11 representing Golden By Products, a waste tire hauler and
- 12 major waste tire facility in northern California, in Merced
- 13 County.
- 14 Been recycling tires since 1997, and we were real
- 15 active in the early stages of the working groups, AB-117 and
- 16 SB-879. And so it's been a real pleasure to work with the
- 17 staff who, I think, deserves an award for being one of the
- 18 most efficient staffs in Sacramento, handling what they've
- 19 handled with such limited staff on board.
- 20 And the Board's support and promotion of very
- 21 diversified markets that are both economically feasible and
- 22 also environmentally desirable. I think that that continued
- 23 goal is important.
- We are also very supportive of regular program
- 25 evaluations, as Mr. Paparian pointed out, think that's a

1 very good thing. And that follows up with industry comments

- 2 that were inputed in the SB-876 process.
- 3 Also we'd like to encourage continued involvement
- 4 of industry stakeholders, as alluded also to in earlier
- 5 conversations, like an advisory group or whatever. I think
- 6 that's very valuable.
- 7 And your staff has done a wonderful job including
- 8 the industry right now. We're currently working with the
- 9 manifest team. And we also will be participating as a large
- 10 hauler in the electronic system, as well.
- 11 So, we thank you again for including us, and for
- 12 allowing us to comment today. And look forward to continue
- 13 working with the Board and staff as part of the solution to
- 14 the tire challenge in California.
- Thank you.
- 16 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: Thank you. Well, that concludes
- 17 our public testimony for today. Just to sum up in terms of
- 18 where we are at this point, at our next meeting we will
- 19 finalize all the budget figures that we went over today. We
- 20 will be revising some of the text and preparing a final
- 21 package to be considered by our Board.
- 22 And at that time I expect to have a full quorum of
- 23 Board Members for this Committee, which is a quorum of four.
- Mr. Paparian, any final words?
- 25 BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Yeah, Mr. Chairman. I did

1 mention that I have some specific language suggestions for

- 2 the content of the five-year plan, which I'd like to leave
- 3 with staff; having to do with intent language, the
- 4 hierarchy, program evaluation, research items, peer review
- 5 and clarification of the use of information from the AB-117
- 6 report.
- 7 Some of this flows from the dollar changes; some
- 8 of it is more policy oriented. So, I'll leave this with
- 9 staff and hopefully we'll be able to incorporate it into the
- 10 five-year plan.
- 11 CHAIRMAN MEDINA: And I want to thank staff for
- 12 all the work that you have done on this. You've done a very
- 13 good job. I also want to thank Board Members Canella and
- 14 Jones, who also sat in on many of these workshops, as did
- 15 previous Board Members. Thank you, Mr. Paparian.
- And we'll see you again after ten days.
- 17 (Whereupon, the Committee Meeting was adjourned.)
- --o0o--

19

20

21

22

24

25

## CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I, JAMES F. PETERS, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California, and Registered Professional Reporter, do hereby certify:

That I am a disinterested person herein; that the foregoing California Integrated Waste Management Board,

Special Waste and Market Development Committee, Special

Meeting was recorded by California Integrated Waste

Management Board, transcribed in typewriting, to the best of our ability, personally proofread by me, James F. Peters, a

Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California.

I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for any of the parties in this matter, nor in any way interested in the outcome of said meeting.

James F. Peters, CSR, RPR
Certified Shorthand Reporter
License Number 10063